West Midlands Combined Authority Overview & Scrutiny Committee Annual Report 2020/21



Contents

Foreword – Councillor Lisa Trickett	3
Foreword – Councillor Cathy Bayton	4
Committee Members 2020/21	5
Introduction	7
Overview & Scrutiny holding the Mayor of the West Midlands and portfolio lead members to account	8
Mayoral Q&A Sessions – Key Findings	11
Spotlight Sessions	14
Pre-Decision Scrutiny	15
Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee	16
Transport Scrutiny Pre- Development Scrutiny	17
Transport Scrutiny: Holding those responsible for transport to account	18
Connect With Scrutiny	19

Foreword

Chair – Councillor Lisa Trickett

In a year that has seen lives and livelihoods lost and our public services at the forefront of responding to the COVID-19 crisis, it can feel that the work of the Overview & Scrutiny Committee is fairly irrelevant. But whilst we quite rightly left the Mayor and his Portfolio Leads free to respond to the immediate crisis, it is in such challenging times as these that I would argue the role of scrutiny is at its most critical. Our role is to provide a perspective outside the main decision makers to reflect the combined concerns and challenges of the communities that form part of the WMCA.

In a post-truth age, it is critical that the integrity of the policy process is maintained and that we ensure that in developing policies and measuring success we are truly drawing on the evidence before us and, critically for Overview & Scrutiny Committee this year, reflecting back into the combined authority the lived experience of our constituents. We must always seek to understand how policy and investment is helping to drive better outcomes for all communities. Our work this past year has shown that the combined authority has some way to go in terms of levelling up or closing the gap between constituent authorities and the life chances of children in our region, but there is still much to be proud of, not least the way in which the communities and combined public services in the region came together during the COVID-19 crisis.

What we are keen to ensure is that we truly did set out the foundations to build back better. The need for jobs, housing and a skills pathway that reflected the challenges of our region are key challenges. The fact that we do not have the powers and resources to adequately address these key challenges is an area where we have found agreement and where I would hope that in the new mayoral term scrutiny can focus on this issue further.

As always, my huge gratitude to members of the committee for the time they have given freely and for the thoughtful and valuable contributions they have all made. The role of scrutiny officers and those who support our governance processes has been critical in ensuring we have maintained balance and integrity of process - not always easy in an election year!

Finally, my congratulations to our Mayor Andy Street on his successful re-election, and goodbye (but, in my case as a Brummie councillor, welcome back!) to Deborah Cadman, the departing Chief Executive whose support for scrutiny has been much appreciated.



Foreword

Chair of Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee – Councillor Cathy Bayton

This past year has been a memorable one as the country has collectively gone through a very difficult time and everyone has been affected in some way. The pandemic has presented incomparable challenges to the transport network as reoccurring lockdowns and enforced social distancing have reduced the demand for travel and public transport use has significantly reduced.

During this challenging time, Overview & Scrutiny Committee has formed the Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee that emerged from a review into the effectiveness of transport governance within the combined authority. I am particularly pleased this year by the work the sub-committee has undertaken, including its focus on the student transport arrangements and young people returning to education, the development of a new Local Transport Plan, transport planning for the 2022 Commonwealth Games and public Q&A sessions held with the Chair of the Transport Delivery Committee and the Portfolio Lead for Transport.

It has been a pleasure to work with colleagues on the sub-committee that are also members of transport scrutiny committees within their own constituent authorities, and it is clear that this type of joined up working shows the value of a combined authority through improved engagement between councils.

Looking forward into next year, the Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee will want to focus on the cost of the delay to the region of HS2, alternative ticketing policies in use in comparable cities and regions, and how the transport-related benefits of hosting a major sporting event can be enjoyed by all communities across the region. We will be keen to see if the legacy effects of the environmental sustainability of the Commonwealth Games can then be used to support the region's wider carbon reduction strategies in subsequent years.

I would like to thank my colleagues and officers for their support and commitment during this year, and I look forward to continuing with this work in the coming year.



Committee Members 2020/21



Councillor Lisa Trickett Birmingham Committee Chair



Councillor Cathy Bayton Dudley Committee Vice-Chair



Councillor Naeem Akhtar Coventry



Councillor Suky Samra Walsall



Paul Brown Black Country LEP



Councillor Stephen Simkins Wolverhampton



Councillor Dean Carroll Shropshire



Councillor Ahmad Bostan Sandwell



Councillor Peter Fowler Birmingham



Councillor Chris Cade Rugby



Councillor Angus Lees Dudley



Councillor Mike Chalk Redditch

Committee Members 2020/21



Councillor Robert Grinsell





Councillor Diane Todd Cannock Chase



Mike Lyons Greater Birmingham & Solihull LEP



Councillor Kate Wild Solihull



Councillor Lucy Seymour-Smith Birmingham



Sarah Windrum Coventry & Warwickshire LEP



Councillor Paul Sweet Wolverhampton

Introduction

Overview and scrutiny is a statutory requirement of the West Midlands Combined Authority. The Overview & Scrutiny Committee discharges this responsibility through oversight of the work of the Mayor, Portfolio Lead Members and the wider WMCA decision making process in order to hold decision makers to account and improve the quality of decisions that the WMCA takes.

Overview & Scrutiny Committee members may make recommendations to the WMCA Board and other committees and call in decisions for further scrutiny and challenge that have already been made. The committee acts as an advocate for residents of the West Midlands by investigating issues that are important to local people and by looking further into matters brought to its attention by the public. From improving the economy to tackling inequality, environmental matters and ensuring that the affordable housing needs for the region are addressed, the Overview & Scrutiny Committee, comprising the region's local councillors, is the body that oversees how all this is done.

While the committee's membership includes local councillors nominated by the WMCA's 18 member councils, it also has three representatives from the region's local enterprise partnerships. This brings a private sector perspective to discussions and ensures that the views of the region's commercial sector are heard at the highest levels of decision making.

The committee performs two functions 'overview' and 'scrutiny'. 'Overview' focuses on the development of policy and 'scrutiny' that looks at decisions that have been made or are about to be made.

Overview & Scrutiny Committee in 2020/21

This year the committee has focused on the post-COVID-19 recovery plan, as it seeks to address the economic and social impact of the pandemic and has scrutinised and challenged across the WMCA to ensure investments and interventions are targeted at closing the region's inequalities and fulfilling the ambition of inclusive growth and tackling climate change. The committee has continued to have broad oversight to the policies of the WMCA and reviews the effectiveness of its key decisions. It has an important role in reviewing and scrutinising the Mayor, Portfolio Lead Members and the WMCA about plans, priorities, corporate governance arrangements and financial affairs.

Overview & Scrutiny's Objective 2020/21

"What is the return on investment for our communities?"



Mayor of the West Midlands

The committee has undertaken a number of public Mayoral Q&A sessions, with questions focusing on the key challenges for the WMCA.

In October, the committee questioned Andy Street on the delivery and impact of the WMCA policies and on matters relating to:

- WMCA's response to the COVID-19 pandemic
- Economic and community recovery work
- Government funding allocations to the region (including the 'Recharge West Midlands' investment case)
- Further funding asks to support recovery work
- Support required for different economic sectors and those facing the prospect of unemployment once the Government's furlough scheme ended

In December, the committee held its second Q&A and questioned the Mayor on financial matters relating to the developing budget for 2021/22, with a particular focus on:

- The use of reserves to achieve a balanced budget for 2021/22
- Longer term financial stability
- Risky assumptions
- Financial planning and modelling reflecting the needs of the region and its diverse communities
- Transport budget and protection of accessible and supported transport services

The Mayor was also joined by the Portfolio Lead for Finance, Councillor Bob Sleigh, who was questioned on matters relating to the Investment Programme.

"These public Q&A sessions were an important part of providing public accountability and transparency of decision-making for the WMCA's only directly elected politician"

Councillor Mike Bird, Portfolio Lead for Housing & Regeneration

In November 2020, the committee invited Councillor Mike Bird, Portfolio Lead for Housing & Regeneration to a Q&A session focusing on housing and regeneration- related matters. Members questioned him on:

- Brownfield Land Redevelopment Fund
- Spend verses the number of housing units delivered to date
- Context in which the WMCA was operating in terms of supporting the housing needs of the region
- Affordable and social housing
- Affordable housing definition



Councillor Ian Brookfield, Portfolio Lead for Economy & Innovation

During the year, Overview & Scrutiny Committee has had a strong focus on the regional recovery plan following the COVID-19 pandemic and has met with Councillor Ian Brookfield, Portfolio Lead for Economy & Innovation to better understand the economic recovery work undertaken by the COVID-19 Economic Impact Group and the thematic priorities that formed the region's 'asks' to attract new Government investment.

In addition, Overview & Scrutiny Committee has also met with Deborah Cadman, Chief Executive and Julia Goldsworthy Director of Strategy to understand the work being undertaken to support the economic recovery of the region following the COVID-19 pandemic in areas such as:

- form that the recovery might take
- arrangements for the strategic leadership and co-ordination of recovery priorities
- workstream planning across the WMCA's portfolio areas
- work to address the disproportionate impact of the pandemic on the region's Black, Asian & Minority Ethnic communities

"Methods of growth for the region need to reflect and address inequalities, ensuring a difference is made to communities and the local economy"

Councillor Lisa Trickett



Outcome

As a result of the Q&A sessions with the Mayor and the Portfolio Lead Members, the following workstreams were undertaken:



A review of a detailed breakdown of the region's 'Recharging the West Midlands' investment case to Government which set out the key immediate asks of the Government from the West Midlands region, totaling £3.2bn of investment An assessment of the extent that projects contained within the 'Recharging the West Midlands' investment case addressed structural needs within the region; in particular:

- Grand Central diagnostics hub
- Battery Gigafactory

The development of an economic funding tracker that mapped Government funding allocations against the 'asks' made within the regional investment case, scrutinised on a bi-monthly basis.

A focus on the Health of the Region and the Regional Health Impact of COVID-19

Establishing a task & finish review: Black Country Economic Recovery

Mayoral Q&A Sessions Key Findings

Delivery and Impact of the WMCA's Policies

The committee had reached a number of conclusions arising out of the responses it had received from the Mayor and drew the following matters to the attention of the WMCA Board in November:

- Whilst recognising the value of the 'Recharge West Midlands' asks of the Government, did it adequately address the existing embedded and systemic inequalities in the region and the challenges currently being faced by residents across the West Midlands seeking to recover from the economic impacts of the pandemic?
- Did the WMCA have a clear plan to enable it to transition its policy objectives to meet the new and emerging challenges across the region, including the COVID-19 pandemic, climate change and automation, especially within sectors and communities still impacted by previous transitions?

- Was there sufficient ambition with the devolution discussions with the Government to deliver to the WMCA the powers and resources necessary to meet the economic and social challenges of the region, and did the WMCA maximise its other sources of funding to address these challenges?
- Did the outputs of the WMCA meet its stated ambitions, and could better use be made of aligning the region's priorities in order to close the inequality gap that currently existed and, as a consequence, deliver lasting inclusive growth?
- Has the WMCA developed sufficient policies that would drive its inclusive growth ambitions and deliver lasting change?
- The development of new practices and reporting to strengthen and consolidate performance information.

WMCA's Budget 2021/22

The following matters were drawn to the attention of the WMCA Board in January, during consideration of the WMCA's 2021/22 budget:

- The need to use reserves to achieve a balanced budget for 2021/22 was noted, but concern was expressed as to the risks associated with this and the limitations it had as a longer term approach to budget planning.
- The WMCA should continue to seek to achieve longer term financial stability that would better enable it to plan for and respond to the needs of the region.
- The Medium Term Financial Plan currently included a number of assumptions that could have a significant negative impact on the WMCA's financial base. It was important that difficult decisions were considered early on in the financial planning process to help to better mitigate potential consequences.

- All future financial planning and modelling should ensure that it reflected and addressed the priorities and needs of the region and its diverse communities.
- The WMCA should lobby for greater flexibility over the use of its direct funding, with which it had previously achieved better outcomes when it had been able to use it in an innovatively way.
- Concern over the possible longer term viability of the transport budget given the likely changes in travel patterns linked to evolving ways of working that could see a permanent reduction in the number of employees commuting into town and city centre locations.

Economic Needs of the Black Country Scrutiny Review

The committee undertook a scrutiny review to consider whether the regional economic recovery proposals were meeting the specific needs identified within the Black Country sub-region.



Key data presented

- 56% of children in the Black Country live in local areas which are within the most deprived fifth of all local areas in England.
- 36% of children in the Black Country live in low-income households ('income poverty')
- In order to reach the Englandwide average employment rate of 75%, 45,000 more Black Country residents needed to be in jobs.
- 82% of those that work in the Black Country also live within this area;
- the Black Country had one of the lowest levels of job density (jobs per head of population) in the country;
- Managerial and professional jobs had a much smaller share of all jobs in the Black Country (38%) than in other parts of the WMCA area (around 50%)
- Too many residents of the Black Country had only level 1 qualifications or below (31% of 25 to 29 year olds) and too few achieved level 3 qualifications (19% of 25 to 29 year olds)

The Overview & Scrutiny Committee made a number of recommendations to the WMCA Board in March grouped around four key areas of activity:

- Coherence of the funding landscape
- Scaling-up immediate support for businesses and people whose jobs were at risk
- Working towards a long-term, whole-life approach
- Co-ordination, governance and accountability across the Black Country



Call-in

The committee has the power to call in decisions of the Mayor and the WMCA Board which have been made but not yet implemented. It exercised this power during the course of the year.

Call-in: Affordable Housing Collaborative Delivery Vehicle

The proposals for the establishment of a new Affordable Housing Delivery Vehicle had been developed following consideration of the matter by the Housing & Land Delivery Board.

The key purpose for this dedicated vehicle was to unlock challenging brownfield sites in the region which would demonstrably not come forward through other means and to deliver additional affordable housing supply.

The Portfolio Lead for Housing & Regeneration and Director for Housing & Regeneration attended Overview & Scrutiny Committee in November to answer questions put to them.

Reason for Call-In:

"The Housing & Land Delivery Board was not made aware of the extent of need and possibility of specifying a purpose to deliver on social housing requirements. Overview & Scrutiny Committee was concerned that members had not been given the information required to make an informed decision and that the report unduly fettered the opportunity to use such a vehicle to deliver on housing need in the region"

Impact/Outcome:

As a result of the Call-In, in January the Housing & Land Delivery Board reconsidered the Affordable Housing Delivery Vehicle report that had been amended to include more detail than that summarised previously and now included information on:

- the history and context of the proposal; and
- addressed the issues raised by the Overview & Scrutiny Committee insofar as:
 - it explained the position with 'affordability' with it being measured against the regional definition
 - assurance regarding the work on governance arrangements for the Delivery Vehicle; and
 - resources in terms of finance

Spotlight Sessions An agile and lighter touch approach to scrutiny reviews

Recharge West Midlands - Investment Case to Government

In 2020/21, the committee held three spotlight sessions with a view to assess the extent that projects addressed structural needs within the region and to review the progress being made in respect of community recovery as a result of the pandemic.

Grand Central Diagnostics Hub

The committee questioned the Director of Implementation on the Grand Central Diagnostics Hub at Birmingham New Street station, focussing on:

 the accessibility of Grand Central station and whether this location successfully met the needs of those suffering from health inequalities.

A further request for information on the assessment being completed on those individuals from inner city communities accessing Grand Central station and those from Black, Asian & Minority Ethnic communities suffering from health inequalities was made.

Information on the suggested individual profile was also requested, as well as the return on investment and target numbers for the usage of the diagnostic hub.

Battery Gigafactory

A spotlight session was held with the Chief Executive of Coventry & Warwickshire Local Enterprise Partnership and the Director of Business, Investment & Culture for Coventry City Council on the Gigafactory proposition. The committee sought further information on:

- the readiness of the WMCA in terms of re-skilling and re-training, particularly in respect of those individuals who may have lost their jobs during the pandemic.
- assurance on the WMCA's efforts to support the Gigafactory bid going forward.
- The beneficial impact for the wider West Midlands region.
- How the project would address issues such as deprivation, educational attainment and poor health across the region

The Health of the Region 2020 / Regional Health Impact of COVID19

In January, the Director of Inclusive Growth & Public Service Reform attended Overview & Scrutiny Committee to report on the health and wellbeing inequalities and impacts of the COVID-19 pandemic in the West Midlands. Questions focused on:

- The community recovery work
- The various workstreams being set up to address and improve outcomes for the minority communities
- Commitments and recommendations to Government
- Initiatives for 'invisible' illnesses and infants missing out on baby classes and socialisation
- Housing being a key contributing factor to health inequalities
- Consideration of those families that were in temporary housing

Pre-Decision Scrutiny

Looking at decisions before they are made provides an important opportunity to influence those decisions, and to improve them. It gives scrutineers an opportunity to challenge assumptions that may have been made as the decision was developed, and also gives them the chance to consider how decisionmakers have considered what risks might arise from the implementation of the decision, and how those risks might be mitigated.

Comprehensive Spending Review – Draft Submission

Overview & Scrutiny Committee scrutinised the draft response to the Government's 2020 Comprehensive Spending Review consultation, focusing on:

- HS2 Interchange
- Further proposals to consider the #WM2041 environmental ambitions and the need to invest into transport infrastructure
- The need to clearly identify which proposals were being prioritised to reflect the needs of the region to make a difference

Overview & Scrutiny Committee's observations and comments helped to form the final draft of the consultation response that was considered by the WMCA Board in September.

Annual Delivery 2020/21 Mid-Year Update

Overview & Scrutiny Committee reviewed the Annual Delivery 2020/21 Mid-Year Update that provided an update on the progress against portfolio deliverables for 2020/21, prior it its submission to the WMCA Board in November.

Members requested that future updates included spend broken down across the seven constituent authorities which would help identify a clearer picture of the allocations across the region in term of investment and resources. Pre-decision scrutiny is the process that enables councillors to engage with the WMCA Board and Mayor before they take decisions.

- It enables scrutiny councillors to gain information and develop an understanding on particular issues.
- 2. It contributes to scrutiny's role as a 'critical friend' to ask questions on upcoming Mayoral or board decisions.
- 3. It is a valuable opportunity for scrutiny to inform and influence decision making through debate and challenge.

WM2041 Five Year Plan: 2021 - 2026

Overview & Scrutiny Committee challenged the Director of Public Service Reform & Inclusive Growth and the Head of Environment on the development of a five-year plan to help meet the #WM2041 net zero carbon ambitions, focusing on:

- The Local Transport Plan
- Regional Air Quality Issues
- Concern that the plan was not ambitious enough and lacked direction in terms of clear and coherent interventions that would lead the region in a net zero carbon environment
- The importance of ensuring systematic inequalities that further disadvantaged certain sections of the population needed to be adequately addressed
- The importance of work on behaviour change.

Overview & Scrutiny Committee's observations and comments helped to form the preparation of the report prior to its submission to the WMCA Board in March.

Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee Sub-Committee Members 2020/21

In 2019/20, the Overview & Scrutiny Committee had recommended the strengthening of the Authority's transport governance arrangements within the West Midlands Combined Authority and across the region. The acceptance of the recommendations had led to the establishment of the Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee.



Councillor Cathy Bayton Dudley Chair



Councillor Philip Bateman MBE Wolverhampton Vice-Chair



Councillor Rois Ali Coventry



Councillor Liz Clements Birmingham



Councillor Ken Hawkins Solihull



Councillor Matt Rogers Dudley



Councillor Gurmeet Singh Sohal Walsall



Councillor Jackie Taylor Sandwell

Transport Scrutiny: Pre-Development Scrutiny

Pre-development scrutiny examines the Mayor and/or WMCA Board's proposals, objectives and draft programmes in order to inform their development before they are further developed and enacted. In this way, the Overview & Scrutiny Committee can help the WMCA to achieve optimum impact by avoiding mistakes and grasping opportunities in its target-setting, policy-making and service delivery.

This approach to pre-development scrutiny is carried out some time before a decision is made – in some instances months ahead of a final decision.

Commonwealth Games Transport Plan

The Director Network Resilience and Technical Director for the Commonwealth Games attended Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee to seek their comments, thoughts and to answer questions in relation to the development of the Commonwealth Games Transport Plan prior to its submission to the WMCA Board in June for approval to consult. Discussions and questions focused on:

- The role of TfWM
- WMCA and TfWM commitments to the Games
- Games Transport Plan, Programme and Timeline of activity
- Legacy principles and priorities
- Transport Legacy
- Sustainability Clean and Green Games
- Transport Security

The following recommendations and observations were fed into the subsequent approval process:

- The importance of capitalising on the whole-region offer of the Commonwealth Games, along with the need for strong working relationships with all delivery partners, specifically in respect of the tourism offer of the region and Transport for West Midlands' ability to help enable towns that were not hosting sporting events to be able to capitalise on the economic benefits hosting the Commonwealth Games provided.
- To better understand the transport-related benefits communities across the region would derive from the hosting of the Commonwealth Games, particularly how the legacy effects of the intention for the games to be environmentally sustainable could be used to support the region's carbon reduction strategies in subsequent years.
- The firm commitment that the Commonwealth Games would commence as planned in July 2022 was welcomed, but the need for a strong contingency plan for circumstances where this turned out not to be possible (eg. a continuation of COVID-19 restrictions) was necessary.

Transport Scrutiny: Holding those responsible for transport to account

Councillor Ian Ward, Portfolio Lead for Transport

In 2020/21, the first ever Q&A session was held with Councillor Ian Ward, Portfolio Lead for Transport, on transport policy related matters. Members questioned him on:

- The three immediate priorities for transport
- Bus franchising
- Cycle hire scheme
- e-scooters
- Concessionary Fares Scheme

The following observations and recommendations were accepted by the Overview & Scrutiny Committee, Portfolio Lead Member for Transport and WMCA Board:

• The key priorities identified by the Portfolio Lead for Transport were endorsed, namely:

- To ensure the bus network recovered to service and patronage levels across the region that existed pre-COVID-19.

- To complete all current Metro capital schemes.

- To pursue further walking and cycling initiatives to help support and encourage the modal shift seen across the region this year.

- Given the current economic situation and the WMCA's financial challenges, existing concessionary travel policies should be maintained in recognition of the wider societal benefits they underpinned.
- The Transport Scrutiny Sub-Committee should undertake a scrutiny review of alternative ticketing policies (including their funding arrangements) in use in comparable cities/ regions around the world with a view to making appropriate recommendations for the Portfolio Lead for Transport's consideration.
- The WMCA and Transport for West Midlands should consider undertaking a programme of appropriate lobbying in support of the 'levelling up' of funding for public transport services and infrastructure across the UK, to better enable residents to have the ability and capability to play their part in the region's economic recovery.
- Transport for West Midlands should liaise with public transport operators/providers to ensure that all workers on the public transport network were provided with appropriate personal protective equipment.

The Young Combined Authority's Involvement in Transport Scrutiny – Kashmire Hawker

Transport scrutiny for me delivered a very insightful experience, which has not just expanded my mindset on how the WMCA's scrutiny responsibilities work, but enabled younger people's voices be heard loud and clear and to get a major understanding of the transport plans currently in place.

The art of good scrutiny is to ensure the right questions can be asked and people can be held accountable. With the scale and scope of the transport-related projects currently being undertaken across the West Midlands, I have developed a real sense of fascination and have a sense pride at playing a small part in region's renaissance!



Councillor Kath Hartley, Transport Delivery Committee, Chair

In February, Councillor Kath Hartley attended a Q&A session to answer questions on transport delivery matters across the region. Questions focussed on:

- Transport Delivery Committee's relationship with the Mayor and transport cabinet members
- How Transport Delivery Committee engaged with other WMCA policies, such as #WM2041 and the carbon reduction targets it contained.
- Work of the Lead Member Reference Groups
- The role of the committee in terms of the recent Gigafactory proposals that were announced for Coventry and how they would improve connectivity to this employment site and other parts of the region.

• The committee's performance management role

Recommendations focussed on:

- Refreshed terms of reference, including specifically setting out role and responsibilities
- The development of member role profiles
- Annual work planning process
- A review of the role and purpose of the committee's Lead Member Reference groups to improve transparency

The recommendations were considered and supported by the Overview & Scrutiny Committee and WMCA Board in March.

Connect with Scrutiny:

Address: WMCA, 16 Summer Lane, Birmingham, B19 3SD Email: lyndsey.roberts@wmca.org.uk Twitter: @WMCA_Scrutiny Web: https://governance.wmca.org.uk/mgCommitteeDetails.aspx?ID=138



